CATEGORY SHIFTS ANALYSIS IN THE TRANSLATION OF THE TALES OF BEEdle THE BARD

Adani Nur Sabrina
Faculty of Letters and Cultures, adaninarsabrina@staff.gunadarma.ac.id, Gunadarma University

ABSTRACT

In the process of translation, numerous challenges oftentimes emerge due to the differences between the source language and the target language. For each difficulty, there are various translation theories and strategies that can be applied to address them. This research focuses on one of the strategies, namely category shifts as proposed by Catford (1965). The sources of the data used are J.K. Rowling’s The Tales of Beedle the Bard (2008) and its Indonesian translation, Kisah-Kisah Beedle Si Juru Cerita (2009). This research aims to find category shifts in the translation and how they are implemented. The method used in conducting the research is descriptive qualitative and the data are chosen randomly. The result of the research shows that the translation uses all kinds of category shifts with a total of 131 data, which include 33 structure-shifts, 32 class-shifts, 52 unit-shifts, and 14 intra-system-shifts. It is expected that this research can be used by translators as they encounter difficulties related to category shifts, or by future researchers who are willing to conduct similar research.

Keywords: Category Shifts, Translation, Translation Strategy

1. INTRODUCTION

Along with the many literary works produced, the demands for translation also increase. As we all know that translation is very instrumental in bridging the author’s mind to the readers who do not speak the same language. In his book, Introducing Translation Studies: Theories and Applications, Munday (2016) stated that translation was firstly affirmed circa 1340 and was derived from either the Latin word “translation” which means transporting or from an Old French word “translation”. He also added that the translation process is about changing the original language of the written text into another written text in a different language. Newmark (1988) shared a similar notion by stating that translation is a process of rendering the meaning from one language to another language carrying the author’s intention of the text. Thus, it can be
said that translation is not simply changing the language, but the translator must also retain the message contained in the text so that the readers can get the original intention of the author.

Translation is sometimes claimed as an art since the translators must also be able to preserve the style of the source text. However, we also cannot forget that translation is, in fact, an exact discipline (Vinay and Darbelnet, 1995). There are problems in the process of translation, but there are also methods to overcome them. This research discusses one of those methods, namely category shifts proposed by Catford (1965).

The data of this research are taken from the original book The Tales of Beedle the Bard written by J.K. Rowling in 2008, and also its Indonesian translation, Kisah-Kisah Beedle Si Juru Cerita by Nina Andiana and Listiana Srisanti in 2009. This work is a supplementary book to the popular sequel of Harry Potter world which contains five bedtime stories for young wizards and witches. Just like muggle tales, such as Cinderella or Snow White, the children stories in this book also have moral values and messages. This research will cover all the five stories entitled The Wizard and the Hopping Pot, The Fountain of Fair Fortune, The Warlock’s Hairy Heart, Babbity Rabbity and Her Cackling Stump, and The Tale of the Three Brothers. The purposes of this research are to find out any category shifts in the Indonesian translation and also how the translator applied in their work.

There are previous researches that are related to the current research. The first is by Kusuma in 2019. The title of his research is “J.K. Rowling’s The Tales of Beedle the Bard: A Magical Realism Analysis”. Even though the current research shares the same source of data, the focus and purposes of the research are different. Kusuma analyzed the magical realism contained in the stories, while the current research discusses the translation of the book with a category shifts strategy.

The second related research that has been conducted is Domestication and Foreignization Strategies on Translated Novel of “The Tales of Beedle the Bard” written by Prajutha in 2010. The similarities between this research and the current research are in the data source and also in the field of study, i.e., translation. However, Prajutha focused on the domestication and foreignization strategies of translation, while the current research focuses on the category shifts strategy.

The next research is written by Situmorang and Afriana in 2019 with the title of An Analysis of Unit Shift and Structure Shift Found in A Little Princess Novel by Frances Hodgson Burnett. This research analyzed similar strategies, that is category shift. However, the researchers only discussed two out of four kinds in the category shifts, namely unit shift and structure shift. Meanwhile, the current research covers all category shifts, including the two, namely class shift and intra-system shift. In addition, this previous research took the data from A Little Princess Novel, while the current research takes the data from The Tales of Beedle the Bard book.

The last research that is similar to the current research is An Analysis on Indonesian English Translation Shifts Found in Two Short Stories of Bilingual Children Book Series Published by “Gema Insani” written by Mabruroh in 2018. There are similarities both in the source of the data and the translation strategies discussed. Both pieces of research use children’s stories, but with different titles. The previous research used two short stories from bilingual children books, while the current research uses five bedtime stories that are contained in The Tales of Beedle the Bard book. Both kinds of research also used Catford’s translation shifts. However, the current research only focuses on the category shifts, while the previous research covers both category shifts and level shifts.

2. LITERATURE REVIEW

According to Catford (1965), translation is a process of substituting a language of a text into another language. He proposed the translation shifts or the changes that often occurred in the process of translation. There are two major kinds of translation shifts:

1) Level Shift, and
2) Category Shift

1.1. Level Shift

Level shifts are the changes from grammar to lexis. Below is an example taken from Margono cited by Suryani (2018).

English : I am working hard.
Indonesian : Saya sedang bekerja.

From the example above, it can be seen that grammatical features am and -ing in English is translated into Indonesian sedang, because the Indonesian language does not have different forms of verbs related to grammar or tenses. Instead, it uses a word (lexis) sedang to identify that an action is in progress.

1.2. Category Shifts
Category shifts are divided into four kinds of other shifts, namely structure-shifts, class-shifts, unit-shifts, and intra-system-shifts.

1.2.1. Structure-Shifts

This kind of shift is the one that frequently occurs in the translation process. Sometimes, the changes emerge in the constituent order of sentence elements such as subject, verb, object, complement, and adverb. Example:

ST: I wash myself. (S V O)
TT: Saya mandi. (S P)
(Margono in Suryani, 2018).

Other than the example above, one major difference between English and Indonesian is the sequence of noun phrase elements.

ST: cute cats (Adjective Noun)
TT: kucing lucu (Noun Adjective)

Since this kind of structure-shift almost occurs all the time, this research does not make such noun-phrase shifts as data.

1.2.2. Class-Shifts

According to Catford, class-shift happens when an item in the source language is translated into a different class in the target language, for example, a noun in the source text is translated into a verb in the target text.

1.2.3. Unit-Shifts

By unit-shift, Catford means shifts of rank, i.e., a unit in the source language might be translated into a different rank in the target language, for example, a word in the source text becomes a phrase in the target text.

1.2.4. Intra-System-Shifts

The term intra-system-shift is chosen instead of system-shift because the shift occurs internally within a system. For example, in the system of numbers: what is plural in the source language might be translated into singular form in the target language, and vice versa.

3. METHODOLOGY

3.1. Research Method

This research uses a descriptive-qualitative method. The instruments of the research are the mind and the body of the researcher herself as the researcher absorbs, sifts through, and interprets the data through observation (Tracy, 2013). The data are taken purposively, meaning that the researcher only selects data that are using category shifts. The data are then analyzed randomly, which means each datum has a chance to be analyzed.

3.2. Procedure of the Research

1. The researcher read both the original book and its Indonesian translation thoroughly in order to comprehend the meaning and the message.
2. The researcher re-read them again, but this time she was also noting down any kinds of category shifts that occur in the translation.
3. The researcher categorized the data into structure-shifts, class-shifts, unit-shifts, and intra-system-shifts.
4. The researcher re-checked the classification in order to make sure there is no mistakes.
5. The researcher chose the data randomly to be analyzed using Catford’s category shifts strategy.

4. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

After collecting the data, the researcher found 131 category shifts which are categorized into 33 structure-shifts, 32 class-shifts, 52 unit-shifts, and 14 intra-system shifts. The source text (ST) is taken from J.K. Rowling’s The Tales of Beedle the Bard in English, and the target text (TT) is taken from its translation, Kisah-Kisah Beedle Si Juru Cerita by Nina Andiana and Listiana Srisanti.
4.1. Structure-Shifts Data

There are 33 structure-shift data found. Below is the discussion of ten of them.

Data 1
ST : Those who could not work magic were, to the son’s mind, worthless … (p. 4)
TT : Menurut anak ini, orang-orang yang tidak memiliki kekuatan sihir sama sekali tak berharga ...

In the data above, the structure-shift occurs in the order of sentence elements. The phrase … to the son’s mind… in the source text is in the middle of the sentence. Meanwhile, its translation Menurut anak ini… is at the beginning of the sentence. This is done to make the translation sounds natural to the reader.

Data 2
ST : A fragment of parchment within the slipper … (p. 4)
TT : Di dalam sepatu itu terdapat sepotong kain … (p.25)

In the data above, the phrase A fragment of parchment… is at the beginning of the clause. Meanwhile, its translation …sepotong kain… is put at the end of the clause. Thus, there occurs a shift in the structure of the sentence.

Data 3
ST : … resolving to use it henceforth as a rubbish pail. (p. 5)
TT : … memutuskan untuk menggunakan kuali tersebut sebagai tempat sampah mulai esok hari (p. 25).

In the third data above, the word … henceforth … is in the middle of the clause, whereas its Indonesian translation, … mulai esok hari … is at the end of the clause. There is a shift in the ordering of the sentence elements.

Data 4
ST : … my family will go hungry tonight (p. 7).
TT : … nanti malam keluargaku pasti akan kelaparan (p. 27).

In the data above, the word … tonight is at the end of the clause, but the translation, namely …nanti malam… is at the beginning of the clause. Therefore, there is a structure-shift with the change in the word order.

Data 5
ST : They met no obstacle until they reached the foot of the hill on which the Fountain stood (p.25).
TT : Tak satu pun rintangan mereka temui sampai mereka mencapai kaki bukit tempat Air Mancur berdiri (p.51).

In the data above, there is a structure-shift when the words …they met… which is at the beginning of the sentence is translated into …mereka temui… which is in the middle of the sentence.

Data 6
ST : … bloated and blind … (p. 27).
TT : … matanya buta dan tubuhnya bengkak … (p. 51).

In the data above, the structure is changed. The word … blind in the source text comes as the latter, while in the Indonesian translation, …matanya buta… comes as the former.

Data 7
ST : … and none of them ever knew or suspected that the Fountain’s waters carried no enchantment at all (p. 35).
TT : Dan tak seorang pun pernah curiga bahwa sebenarnya Air Mancur Majur Melimpah sama sekali tidak memiliki keajaiban (p. 60).

In the data above, the words … at all is at the end of the sentence. Meanwhile, in the Indonesian translation, … sama sekali ... is in the middle of the sentence. Thus, there occurs a structure-shift.

Data 8
ST : Their words dealt dreadful blows to the listening warlock’s pride (p. 48).
TT : Mendengar percakapan itu, harga diri sang penyihir sangat tersinggung (p. 74).
In the eighth data above, pride is at the end of the sentence, whereas its Indonesian translation ... harga diri ... is in the middle of the sentence. Therefore, there occurs a structure-shift.

Data 9  
ST : She sensed the coldness that lay behind the warmth of his flattery (p. 49).  
TT : Dia merasakan bahwa di balik hangatnya pujian sang penyihir, sebenarnya hati penyihir itu sangat dingin (p. 76).

In the data above, the word ... coldness ... is in the middle of the sentence, but the Indonesian translation is at the end of the sentence ... dingin.

Data 10  
ST : In a corner behind her, the King’s sheets were washing themselves in a wooden tub (p. 68).  
TT : Di salah satu pojok pondok, dalam sebuah ember kayu, seprai-seprai raja tercuci sendiri (p. 96).

In the data above, ... a wooden tub ... is at the end of the sentence. Meanwhile, the Indonesian translation ... sebuah ember kayu ... is in the middle of the sentence. There is a structure-shift in the order of sentence elements.

4.2. Class-Shift Data

Out of 32 data found in the class-shift category, the researcher will discuss ten of them.

Data 1  
ST : There was once a kindly old wizard who used his magic generously and wisely for the benefit of his neighbours (p. 3).  
TT : Pada suatu masa, hiduplah penyihir tua baik hati yang menggunakan sihirnya untuk menolong para tetangganya (p. 23).

From the data above, we can see that ...benefit... is a noun. However, in the Indonesian translation, that particular item is shifted into a verb, that is ...menolong... The translators did the shift because if they retain the part of speech, the translation will be ...menggunakan sihirnya untuk keuntungan para tetangganya which does not sound natural in the Indonesian language.

Data 2  
ST : ... and there, to his amazement, he saw his father’s old cooking pot ... (p. 5).  
TT : Dan di sana, dia sangat takjub ketika melihat kuali tua milik ayahnya ... (p. 25).

In the original text, ...amazement... is a noun. Meanwhile, in the Indonesian translation, that item is translated in the form of an adjective ... takjub ... Therefore, there occurs a class-shift from noun to adjective.

Data 3  
ST : The wizard could not sleep all night for the banging of the warty old pot by his bedside ... (p. 6)  
TT : Semalaman si penyihir tak bisa tidur karena kuali itu terus-menerus melompat di sebelah ranjangnya (p. 27).

From the data above, we can see that ...the banging... is a noun phrase. However, when it is translated into Indonesian, there occurs a class-shift from a noun phrase into a verb phrase ...terus-menerus melompat... which does not sound natural in the Indonesian language.

Data 4  
ST : ... not all his magical powers could quieten the warty pot ... (p. 7)  
TT : ... seluruh kekuatan sihir yang dia miliki tak mampu membuat kuali kutilan itu diam (p. 28).

The verb ...quieten... in the English source text is shifted into an adjective ...diam... in the Indonesian target text. Thus, there is a class-shift from a verb to an adjective in the translation.

Data 5  
ST : “My baby is grievously ill,” she said (p. 8).  
TT : “Bayiku sakit amat parah,” katanya (p. 28).

In the English source text, ...grievously... is an adverb. However, in the Indonesian translation, that part of the sentence is shifted into an adjective ...parah... This kind of change is done because if the translators translated the word literally, it will become Bayiku sakit secara menyedihkan which sounds strange and unnatural in the target language. Therefore, the class-shift of adverb into adjective occurs to address the problem.
Data 6
ST : Your father bade me come if troubled — (p. 8).
TT : Ayahmu menyuruhku datang kapan pun aka punya masalah (p. 28).

The word ... troubled in the source text is an adjective. However, in the Indonesian translation, it is changed into a verb phrase ... punya masalah... There occurs a class-shift from an adjective to a verb, because if the translators translated it literally, it will become Ayahmu menyuruhku datang kalau bermasalah, and it does not sound clear to the Indonesian readers.

Data 7
ST : It will be hard enough to decide which of us it will be, without adding another! (p. 24).
TT : Sudah cukup sulit menentukan siapa di antara kita yang berhak melakukan, dan sekarang ada tambahan seorang lagi! (p. 49).

From the data above, the verb ... adding... in the source text is translated into a different part of speech, that is ... tambahan... which is categorized as a noun. Thus, in that translation occurs a class-shift from a verb to a noun.

Data 8
ST : And once again he congratulated himself upon the wisdom of his early choice (p. 47).
TT : Dan sekali lagi si penyihir memberi selamat kepada diri sendiri atas keputusannya yang bijaksana pada masa lalu (p. 73).

The word ... wisdom... in the source language is a noun, but when it is translated into Indonesian, it becomes an adjective ... bijaksana... This class-shift occurs because if the translators retain the word class, the translation will be Dan sekali lagi si penyihir memberi selamat kepada diri sendiri atas kebijaksanaan dari keputusannya terdahulu. Even though it is still understandable, that translation sounds unnatural and forced in the target language.

Data 9
ST : The warlock was sure that he must be an object of immense envy to all who beheld his splendid and untroubled solitude (p. 47).
TT : Sang penyihir yakin bahwa semua orang iri padanya, iri pada kesendiriannya yang sempurna dan tak terganggu (p. 73).

In the data above, there is a class-shift from noun to adjective. The word ... envy... in the source text is a noun, and it is translated into ... iri... which is an adjective in the target text.

Data 10
ST : For one moment, the warlock knelt triumphant, with a heart clutched in each hand ... (p. 54).
TT : Untuk sesaat, sang penyihir berlutut dalam kemenangan, masing-masing tangan menggenggam satu hati (p. 81).

The word ... triumphant ... is an adjective. However, in the translation, it is changed into a noun ... kemenangan... Supposed the translators preserve the adjective form, the translation will be ... sang penyihir berlutut berjaya... which does not make any sense in the target language. Thus, there occurs a class-shift from an adjective to a noun, so that the translation can sound natural and clear to the readers.

4.3. Unit-Shift Data

After gathering and classifying the data, there are 52 data found in the category of unit-shifts. In this section, the researcher will discuss ten of them.

Data 1
ST : ... he was unable to prevent the pot hopping after him out of the kitchen, and then following him up to bed, clanging and banging loudly on every wooden stair (p. 6).
TT : ... dia tak mampu mencegah kuali itu melompat-lompat mengejarnya keluar dapur, lalu mengikuti ke kamar tidur, terus melompat dengan berisik di setiap anak tangga kau (p. 26).

In the source text, ... stair... is a word. However, in the Indonesian translation, it becomes a phrase ... anak tangga... because that is the real equivalent in the target language.

Data 2
ST : “Tis my old donkey, Sir,” he explained (p. 7).
TT : “Keledai tuaku, Sir,” jelas si laki-laki tua (p. 27).
In the source language, ‘Tis my old donkey… is a clause. However, in the Indonesian translation, it becomes the phrase Keledai tuaku… If the translators kept the clause form, it would become Ini adalah keledai tuaku… which does not sound natural to the context. Hence, there is a unit-shift from clause to phrase in the translation.

Data 3
The phrase Be silent in the source text is translated into the word Diamlah in the target text. Thus, there occurs a unit-shift from phrase to word.

Data 4
ST: Minstrels strummed on silk-stringed lutes and sang of a love their master had never felt (p. 50).
TT: Para pemusik memainkan suling-suling berlapis sutra, menyanyikan lagu tentang cinta yang tak pernah dirasakan tuan mereka (p. 76).
In the data above, there is a unit-shift from morpheme to word. The plural marker -s in the word Minstrels is translated into the word Para… in Indonesian, because the Indonesian language does not have morpheme to indicate pluralization.

Data 5
ST: … arrived at the palace, claiming to be a wizard of enormous skill (p. 64).
TT: Maka dia datang ke istana, mengaku sebagai penyihir hebat (p. 92).
In the source text, …enormous skill is a phrase and is translated into a single word …hebat in Indonesian. Thus, there occurs a unit-shift from phrase to word.

Data 6
ST: The warlock was sure that he must be an object of immense envy to all who beheld his splendid and untroubled solitude (p. 47).
TT: Sang penyihir yakin bahwa semua orang iri padanya, iri pada kesendiriannya yang sempurna dan tak terganggu (p. 73).
In the data above, there is a unit-shift from morpheme to word. The morpheme un- in the source text is translated into the word …tak… in the target text because the Indonesian language does not have morpheme to indicate negation.

Data 7
ST: Her name was Babitty, and she was the washerwoman who kept the palace linens soft, fragrant, and white (p. 65).
TT: Nama perempuan itu Babbity, dan dia adalah tukang cuci yang membuat semua seprai di istana tetap lembut, wangi, dan putih (p. 93).
The word …washerwoman… in the source text is translated into the phrase …tukang cuci… in the target text. This happens because actually, the English word is a compound noun made of two words washer and woman, while the Indonesian language does not make such a compound and keeps it in the form of a phrase.

Data 8
ST: … making a fearful noise upon the flagstones (p. 5).
TT: …membuat suara yang sangat berisik ketika kaki perunggunya berdentam-dentam di atas lantai batu (p. 26).
The word …flagstones in the source text is translated into the phrase …lantai batu because that is the equivalent in Indonesian. Thus, there occurs a unit-shift from word to phrase.

Data 9
ST: “Faint heart!” she chided him (p. 25).
TT: “Pengecut!” katanya mencemooh sang kesatria (p. 49).
Faint heart is a phrase in the source text. However, when it is translated into Indonesian, it becomes a single word Pengecut. Thus, there occurs a unit-shift from phrase to word in the Indonesian translation.

Data 10
ST: “Good sir, you must bathe, as a reward for all your chivalry!” she told Sir Luckless (p. 34).
TT: “Kesatria yang baik, Andalah yang harus membasuh diri di Air Mancur, sebagai balasan atas semua tindakan kesatria Anda!” kata Amata pada Sir Luckless (p. 58).
The word ...chivalry in the source text is translated into ...tindakan kesatria... in Indonesian, which takes the form of a phrase. Thus, a unit-shift of word to phrase occurs in the translation.

4.4. Intra-System-Shift Data

The last type of Catford’s category shift is intra-system-shift. After collecting the data, a total of 14 data were found that belong to intra-system-shift. The researcher will only discuss two of them because there are only two kinds of intra-system-shift found in the translation, i.e., plural to singular and singular to plural.

Data 1

| ST | The creepers tugged the three witches through the chink in the wall… (p. 24). |
| TT | Tanaman merambat itu menarik ketiga penyihir masuk ke celah kecil di dinding... (p. 48). |

In the source text, ...creepers... is plural. However, when it is translated into Indonesian, Tanaman merambat... is singular. Even though the Indonesian language does not have any morpheme that indicates pluralization, there are other ways to show that a certain noun is plural, either by using words that show pluralization such as beberapa, semua, etc. or by repeating the noun such as Tanaman-tanaman merambat... Thus, in this translation, there is an intra-system-shift from plural to singular.

Data 2

| ST | The charlatan instructed her to conceal herself inside a bush while the King gave his magical display… (p. 69). |
| TT | Si penipu menyuruh Babbity bersembunyi di balik semak-semak sementara Raja mempertontonkan keahlian sihirnya (p. 97). |

In the source text, ...a bush... is a singular noun identified by the article “a”. However, in the Indonesian translation, it becomes plural ...semak-semak... which is indicated by the repeating noun. Thus, there is an intra-system-shift from singular to plural.

5. CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTIONS

Regarding the category shifts implemented in the Indonesian translation of The Tales of Beedle the Bard, it can be concluded that there are 131 data found that are categorized into 33 structure-shifts, 32 class-shifts, 53 unit-shifts, and 14 intra-system shifts. Catford mentioned that the most frequent shift is structure-shift. Even though the result does not share the same notion, Catford’s statement is true because as the researcher previously stated, this analysis does not include the structure-shift of the noun phrase which is made of adjective + noun. The reason the researcher did this is that it is one of the major differences between English and Indonesian, and of course, there will be an abundance of data, thus justifying Catford’s statement that structure-shift is the most frequent shift in the translation.

The result and discussion also show that in doing translations, any translator must be able to decide how he or she will change the items from the source text to the target text in order to preserve the true meaning and messages intended by the author.

The researcher hopes this research can be useful for future researchers who are interested in conducting similar research. The researcher suggests that other than category shifts, future researchers can also cover the level shifts proposed by Catford or some other translation shifts suggested by other experts.

REFERENCE


