

The Implementation of Gottlieb's Subtitling Strategies in the Film *When Harry Met Sally*

Ariza Purnawati¹, Ayesha Sofiah Karimah²
Faculty of Letters and Cultures, Gunadarma University

Article History

Received : 09 January 2026
Revised : 09 January 2026
Accepted : 28 February 2026
Published : 22 April 2026

Corresponding author*:

arizapur31@staff.gunadarma.ac.id

Cite This Article:

Purnawati, A., & Sofiah Karimah, A. (2026). The Implementation of Gottlieb's Subtitling Strategies in the Film *When Harry Met Sally*. *Jurnal Sosial Humaniora Dan Pendidikan*, 5(1), 51–63.

DOI:

<https://doi.org/10.56127/jushpen.v5i1.2688>

Abstract: This study aims to analyze the subtitling strategies used in the translation of the film subtitle *When Harry Met Sally* from English to Indonesian. This study employs Henrik Gottlieb's theory of subtitling strategies. A qualitative descriptive method is used, with data sources consisting of the English and Indonesian subtitles from the film. The data were analyzed based on the ten subtitling strategies proposed by Gottlieb: expansion, paraphrase, transfer, imitation, transcription, dislocation, condensation, decimation, deletion, and resignation. The results of the study indicate that paraphrase was the most dominant strategy, accounting for 36% of the total data. Conversely, dislocation and transcription were the least frequently used strategies, with each representing only 2%. The dominant use of the paraphrase strategy suggests that in films containing a significant amount of dialogue with ambiguity, metaphors, and figurative language, the paraphrase strategy is necessary to preserve meaning and prevent it from being lost in the translation process. Meanwhile, the dislocation strategy was rarely used because there were no singing scenes or significant musical elements in the film. Furthermore, the absence of a third language in the film's dialogue meant that the transcription strategy was the least frequently used. These findings indicate that the choice of subtitling strategy is strongly influenced by the characteristics of the dialogue and the linguistic context of the film being translated.

Keywords: subtitling, Gottlieb's strategies, film, audiovisual translation

INTRODUCTION

Subtitling is a form of audiovisual translation that converts spoken language into written text displayed on screen, while maintaining synchronization with the original audio and accounting for spatial and temporal constraints (Díaz Cintas & Remael, 2007). Unlike other types of translation, subtitling operates within strict constraints of time, space, and synchronization, requiring the translator to make strategic linguistic and cultural choices.

In audiovisual translation, there are several key aspects that must be carefully considered. These aspects include the interaction between verbal and nonverbal elements, the representation of cultural context, the degree of fidelity to the source text, and the characteristics of the target audience (Frederic Chaume, 2012). According to Díaz Cintas (2012), subtitling aims not only to convey the propositional meaning of the source language dialogue but also to adapt the pragmatic meaning and cultural references so that they remain accessible and acceptable to the target audience. These challenges underscore that subtitling is a complex and strategic translation practice, not merely a lexical or word-for-word translation process (Henrik Gottlieb, 1998).

To address the various challenges in subtitling, a number of theoretical frameworks have been developed; one of the most influential is the subtitling strategy model proposed by Henrik Gottlieb. Gottlieb (1992, 1998) classifies ten subtitling strategies: expansion,

paraphrase, transfer, imitation, transcription, dislocation, condensation, decimation, deletion, and resignation. These subtitling strategies provide a systematic framework for analyzing how meaning is transferred and negotiated between the source and target languages within the constraints of the audiovisual medium. Gottlieb's subtitling strategies have also become a theoretical reference that helps researchers assess the extent to which audiovisual translation is accurate while maintaining synchronization with the original audio to convey the intended meaning.

In audiovisual translation research, Gottlieb's subtitling strategies have become an important reference for assessing the accuracy of translations and the synchronization of subtitles with the original dialogue or audio. In the film *The School for Good and Evil* (2022), Pramadanti and Aryanika (2025) found that strategies such as transfer, paraphrase, and condensation can be used predominantly in subtitling and that such subtitles are deemed accurate based on a comprehensive analysis. Meanwhile, Setiawan et al. (2023) predominantly used Gottlieb's transfer strategy in their study of the film *Inside Out* (2015). This choice of strategy illustrates how the strategies used most frequently can influence the quality of subtitle translation. Another study using Gottlieb's strategy was conducted by Widyaningsih et al. (2022) on the film *Paterson* (2016). In that study, the relationship between the distribution of Gottlieb's subtitling strategies and the accuracy level of English–Indonesian subtitles was influenced by the use of transfer and paraphrase strategies, which were the most frequently used strategies and contributed to translations categorized as accurate. Meanwhile, in another study on the film *Penyalin Cahaya* (2021), Alkafi (2025) used Gottlieb's strategy by grouping cultural words and evaluating the quality of the translation to assess the synchronization and accuracy of meaning in the film's subtitles.

This study focuses on the accuracy and semantic synchronization of the subtitles in the film *When Harry Met Sally* (1989). The film stars Meg Ryan and Billy Crystal as a pair of friends named Sally and Harry who meet in college and continue to cross paths years later on various occasions. What is unique about Harry and Sally's relationship is that every time they break up with their respective partners, they meet and try to resolve their past mistakes. From a linguistic perspective, this film features natural dialogue, which presents challenges in audiovisual translation. From a subtitling perspective, the film requires precise strategies to convey meaning, particularly when translating culture-specific humor and gender dynamics into the target language. Based on this, this study focuses on analyzing subtitling strategies using Gottlieb's framework in the film *When Harry Met Sally* (1989).

THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

“Plot work” in subtitle translation involves translating the film script from the source language (SL) into the target language (TL), then integrating the translation with the film and revising it (Hariyanto, 2005). The film script refers to the source text (ST) that will be translated into the target text (TT). There are two types of scripts: the original script and the script intended for the film translator. The difference between these two types of scripts is crucial because it affects how translation strategies are applied to maintain synchronization between speaking duration and on-screen text space. In line with the views of Díaz Cintas and Remael (2007), subtitle analysis in research should utilize a target script that has undergone the spotting process, given the nature of audiovisual translation, which is heavily constrained by time and screen space limitations. Nevertheless, Toury (1995)

argues that the use of target-language subtitle scripts as primary data—based on the argument that these texts are a concrete representation of the audiovisual translation product consumed by the target-language audience—can be relevant for analysis.

This study implements the theory of Henrik Gottlieb's subtitling strategies. Gottlieb (1992, 1998) classified ten subtitling strategies, which include expansion, paraphrase, transfer, imitation, transcription, dislocation, condensation, decimation, deletion, and resignation. These various strategies are used to explain how spoken language is converted into written text on the screen. The use of these strategies is as follows:

1. Expansion, a strategy used when the source text requires clarification due to cultural nuances that cannot be directly translated into the target language.
2. Paraphrasing, a strategy used when the subtitle translator does not follow the same syntactic rules when translating dialogue. In other words, the translator uses this strategy to alter the structure of the subtitles so they are easier for the audience to understand and read.
3. Transfer, a strategy of translating the source text completely and accurately, without adding explanations or modifying the meaning, as the translator renders the dialogue literally. Additionally, using this strategy preserves the structure of the original text.
4. Imitation, a strategy that preserves the same form, typically involving the names of people and places.
5. Transcription, a strategy used in cases where a term is uncommon even in the source text, such as the use of a third language or a meaningless language.
6. Dislocation, a strategy applied when the original text employs a specific stylistic device.
7. Condensation, a strategy that shortens a text by omitting unnecessary expressions and using shorter ones, without losing the message. Sometimes pragmatic effects can be lost when using reduction strategies. Therefore, the text's actual purpose must be conveyed.
8. Decimation, a strategy used in translation when speakers are debating and speaking rapidly. Consequently, the translator also compresses the speech because it is difficult to incorporate such rapid, unstructured speech into written text.
9. Deletion, a strategy that involves removing parts of the text.

Resignation, a strategy employed when no suitable translation can be found and some loss of meaning is unavoidable.

METHOD

This study employs a descriptive-analytical research design analyzed using qualitative methods. According to Creswell and Poth (2018), qualitative research is an approach to exploring and understanding meaning; the process involves collecting text-based data (words), inductive analysis (from data to concepts/themes), and the researcher's interpretation of meaning. Data were collected from the original scripts by Rob Reiner and Nora Ephron, sourced from [dailyscript.com](#), and their Indonesian translations from [subdl.com](#). The data collection methods for each strategy were based on Henrik Gottlieb's strategy framework. The data collection method is quantitative; however, because the criteria used to categorize each strategy are based on linguistic theory—which might differ

if another linguistic theory were used—the researcher concluded that the data collection method is qualitative. Meanwhile, the writing method employs a descriptive-analytical approach, which analyzes translation strategies to describe their quality and how well the data align with each strategy.

The research process began by collecting data in both written (scripts) and audiovisual (films) formats, and comparing them with the Indonesian translations. After all the data had been collected, the researcher then categorized each piece of data into several strategies and matched them with the Indonesian translations. The researcher analyzed why the data found were appropriate matches for the strategies used. The researchers also analyzed the translation strategies and their alignment with the film *When Harry Met Sally* as a whole to ensure the essence of the original film is preserved while remaining accessible to Indonesian audiences. After the collected data were categorized, they were calculated to determine the percentage of each strategy. The results are then presented in tabular form; the complete sample can be found in the analysis of discussion. The final results of this categorized sample data will reveal which strategies are frequently and rarely used by translators.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

This study was conducted to identify the translation strategies used in the Indonesian subtitles of the film “*When Harry Met Sally*.” Each sentence in the dialogue was classified based on the type of translation strategy. In the table below, the number of times each strategy was used in the film “*When Harry Met Sally*” indicates the percentage of the frequency of Gottlieb’s strategy in the analysis of the film’s subtitles, as follows:

Table 1. Frequency of Strategies Usage

No	Gottlieb’s Strategy	Frequency	Percentage
1	Expansion	5	10%
2	Transfer	2	4%
3	Deletion	5	10%
4	Paraphrase	18	36%
5	Imitation	5	10%
6	Decimation	5	10%
7	Condensation	6	12%
8	Resignation	2	4%
9	Transcription	1	2%
10	Dislocation	1	2%
Total		50	100%

As shown in the results above, based on Gottlieb’s subtitling strategies as applied in the subtitles for the film “When Harry Met Sally,” all of Gottlieb’s strategies were used. However, the paraphrase strategy predominated, while transcription and dislocation were very rarely found. The implementation of Gottlieb’s strategies in the subtitles for this film is explained in the data analysis below.

1. Expansion

According to Gottlieb (1992), expansion is a strategy used when dialogue in the source language requires additional explanation to be understood by the target language audience, especially when there are cultural nuances that are not immediately apparent. In the film *When Harry Met Sally*, this strategy is found in several instances where lexical elements or specific information are added to clarify the meaning of the utterance. These additions aim to help the audience understand the cultural context or situations not explicitly conveyed in the source language. The following is an analysis.

SL: English	TL: Indonesian
1. I came here tonight because when you realise you want to spend the rest of your life with someone, you want the rest of your life to start as soon as possible.	1. Aku datang kesini, karena ketika kau menyadari bahwa kau mau menghabiskan sisa hidupmu dengan seseorang yang mau memberikan sisa hidupnya untuk memulai kehidupan yang baru secepatnya.
2. I'm saying the right man for you might be out there right now and if you don't grab him, someone else will and you'll have to spend the rest of your life knowing that someone else is married to your husband.	2. Yang kumaksudkan adalah, orang yang tepat mungkin ada di luar sana dan jika kau tidak mengambilnya, maka orang lain yang akan mengambilnya. Dan kau akan menghabiskan sisa hidupmu untuk mengetahui bahwa seseorang menikahi seseorang yang harusnya menjadi suaminya.

The first data classified as an instance of expansion in the film *When Harry Met Sally* is “I came here tonight because when you realise you want to spend the rest of your life with someone, you want the rest of your life to start as soon as possible.” Which is translated into “*aku datang kesini, karena ketika kau menyadari bahwa kau mau menghabiskan sisa hidupmu dengan seseorang yang mau memberikan sisa hidupnya untuk memulai kehidupan yang baru secepatnya.*” The part that requires expansion is “you want the rest of your life to start as soon as possible.” This section requires further clarification regarding the scenario Harry envisioned, so the following clause has been added, “*yang mau memberikan sisa hidupnya untuk memulai kehidupan yang baru secepatnya.*” This

addition is intended to help Indonesian-speaking viewers understand that the “life” Harry is referring to is either “the new life” or “the rest of his life.”

The second data of expansion identified by the researchers is derived from a conversation in which Sally’s friend, Marie, advises her not to waste time searching for the right partner. In the source language, Marie implies that if Sally does not act promptly, another person will take him. If this dialogue is translated using the transfer strategy, it would become “*orang lain akan,*” and that clause does not provide a clear explanation of the action, so further clarification regarding “someone else who would get your man” is needed. The same applies to the phrase “someone else is married to your husband,” which uses the present tense as if the speaker already knows who the man in question is. However, when translated, to avoid the misunderstanding that the speaker already knows about the man they are talking about, the phrase uses the future tense: “your husband-to-be/*harusnya menjadi suamimu.*” Thus, the audience will understand that in this scenario, the two women having the conversation are merely imagining a scenario that will unfold in the future.

2. Transfer

According to Gottlieb (1992), transfer is a strategy in which each word is translated completely and accurately from the source language to the target language without altering the sentence structure. In this study, the transfer strategy was found in several data points as follows.

SL: English	TL: Indonesian
<p>1. All this time, I’ve been saying he didn’t want to get married. The truth is, he didn’t wanna marry me. He didn’t love me.</p>	<p>1. Selama ini, aku selalu mengatakan bahwa dia tidak mau menikah. Tapi kenyataannya adalah, dia tidak mau menikahiku. Dia tidak mencintaiku.</p>
<p>2. It might be months before we’re actually able to enjoy going out with someone new.</p>	<p>2. Ini mungkin membutuhkan berbulan-bulan sebelum kita nyaman pergi dengan yang baru.</p>

The transfer strategy is not a commonly used approach because it is rare to find English dialogue that can be translated verbatim without altering the sentence structure. In the translation of this film’s subtitles, it is only found a few instances where the text was translated verbatim into the target language. In the following text, Sally is speaking to Harry after her ex-boyfriend got married, saying, “All this time, I’ve been saying he didn’t want to get married. The truth is, he didn’t want to marry me. He didn’t love me.” This data is translated into “*Selama ini, aku selalu mengatakan bahwa dia tidak mau menikah.*

Tapi kenyataanya adalah, dia tidak mau menikahiku. Dia tidak mencintaiku.” In this translation, the sentence structure is the same, and nothing has been omitted or added.

Another example is when Sally and her friend are having a conversation after a breakup; “It might be months before we’re actually able to enjoy going out with someone new” is translated as “*Ini mungkin membutuhkan berbulan-bulan sebelum kita nyaman pergi dengan yang baru.*” There is no change in the sentence structure because each word conveys the exact meaning without requiring paraphrasing. In fact, the phrase “someone new” can be understood as a new person without any additional explanation.

3. Deletion

According to Gottlieb (1992), deletion refers to the removal of certain elements from a text, such as repetitions, fillers, or interrogative phrases that are deemed non-essential to conveying the main meaning. This strategy is typically used to accommodate space and time constraints in subtitling, ensuring that only the most relevant information is retained in the translated text. Thus, such deletions do not hinder the audience’s understanding of the main message being conveyed. The following is an example found.

SL: English	TL: Indonesian
1. I’m going to get up for some water so it’s no trouble.	1. Aku akan bangun untuk mengambil minuman.
2. I want my friends to benefit from the wisdom of my experience.	2. Aku ingin teman-temanku mengambil hikmah dari pengalamanku.

The first data using deletion is taken from the scene where Sally says she’s going to get some water, so the translation “*aku akan bangun untuk mengambil air*” is sufficient to inform the audience of the action. Therefore, the translator omitted the phrase “if it’s not trouble” because it was unnecessary. Meanwhile, in the second data, Harry tells Sally that he wants his friend to gain something and experience, so the translator decided to remove the phrase “the wisdom” because the meaning of this sentence is already clear, and translating “the wisdom” as “*kebijaksanaan*” in Indonesian does not fit the context of the conversation.

4. Paraphrase

Gottlieb (1992) notes that paraphrase is used when the syntactic structure of the source language cannot be directly reproduced in the target language, necessitating an adjustment to the wording without altering the underlying meaning. In other words, the translation in the target language differs syntactically from the source language, yet the message is preserved so that it can be understood by the audience. This strategy allows the translator to convey meaning more naturally and contextually in accordance with the rules of the target language. Of the 18 data identified by the researcher in the film *When Harry Met*

Sally, there are three of the most complex data of the paraphrase strategy. The followings are the analysis

SL: English	TL: Indonesian
1. Get out of here	1. Kau bercanda
2. I get to the door and the movers are there	2. Aku menuju pintu dan ada kuli angkut disana
3. I love that you get cold when it's 71 degrees out.	3. Aku suka kamu gampang merasa kedinginan meskipun cuacanya sebenarnya tidak terlalu dingin.

The first data is taken from a scene where Sally’s friend, Marie, reacts to an unbelievable fact she hears from Harry’s friend, Jess. The phrase “get out of here” is a common expression, especially in America, used to respond to something unbelievable or nonsensical. However, the translator had to paraphrase the sentence because it would be difficult for Indonesian audiences to understand, especially without context regarding what they were talking about or how it was conveyed based on the speaker’s delivery. Therefore, the phrase “kau bercanda” is used instead to prevent the misunderstanding that someone is telling someone else to leave the room. In the second data, there is the term “movers,” or workers who help people move house. Again, this term is not common to Indonesian speakers, so the translation “porters” is needed to provide a clear explanation of what Harry means by “movers.” In this case, of course, no single word is translated into Indonesian, but the meaning remains accurate.

In the third data, the sentence “... it’s 71 degrees out” is translated as “*cuacanya sebenarnya tidak terlalu dingin.*” In American culture, a temperature of 71°F (equivalent to about 21.6°C) is a cool but normal room temperature. If translated literally as “71 degrees”, Indonesian viewers would imagine a very hot temperature (since Indonesia uses Celsius). The translator chose to replace the number with a descriptive equivalent: a temperature that is “*tidak terlalu dingin.*” This paraphrase strategy successfully preserves the emotional impact and romantic message of the original sentence without burdening the audience with a mathematical conversion that is irrelevant in the context of everyday conversation.

5. Imitation

Imitation is used to translate proper nouns such as names, places, countries, and product brands. In such cases, the translator decides to retain the names of people, places, brands, etc., because they are considered widely known or have a universal meaning that is not unique to a single language. The following are two examples identified by the researcher.

SL: English	TL: Indonesian
1. Especially, when I’m being told how to live my life by Miss Hospital Corners .	1. Terutama ketika aku dinasehati tentang bagaimana menjalani kehidupanku oleh Miss Hospital Corners .
2. This stupid wagon wheel, Roy-Rogers’ garage sale coffee table!	2. Roda wagon Roy-Rogers jelek ini, akan kalian jual ke garage sale !

In the first data of imitation, the phrase “Miss Hospital Corners” isn’t a common nickname like “loser” or “party pooper.” However, its meaning becomes very clear if we pay attention to the dialogue that precedes it. In this case, Harry rejects the life advice Sally gives him, so he calls her “Miss Hospital Corners,” meaning a woman who meddles too much in a man’s life by lecturing him on how to improve it. This strategy is often misunderstood as a translation error because there is no direct equivalent for “Miss Hospital Corners” in Indonesian. However, retaining the original form in the translation minimizes misunderstandings in the Indonesian version, given that the phrase is connected to the preceding dialogue. Therefore, this strategy clearly falls under the category of imitation.

In the second data, Harry points to a coffee table made from a wagon wheel; while the Indonesian word for “wagon” is “*gerobak*,” the translator chose to retain the term “wagon” to avoid any misunderstanding about the type of wagon he was referring to. Meanwhile, “Roy Rogers”—referring to the name of an American country music artist associated with the cowboy character mentioned by Harry in this context—is used because he is mocking the fact that the wagon table looks like something straight out of a cowboy movie. Meanwhile, the term “garage sale” could actually be translated as “*pasar loak*,” “*pasar barang bekas*,” or “*cuci gudang*.” However, the translator decided to retain the original term because “garage sale” as “*pasar loak*” is not common in Indonesia, and using “*cuci gudang*” as the translation for “garage sale” could have a different meaning since “*cuci gudang*” in Indonesia is more like a supermarket or a general store rather than a home-based secondhand shop selling unbranded items.

6. Decimation

Decimation is a strategy in which the translator removes key elements that are considered taboo or confusing to the target audience. The following is an analysis.

SL: English	TL: Indonesian
1. A lot of suicides .	1. Banyak pengorbanan .

2. Well, that symptom is fucking my wife!	2. Gejala itu merusak istriku!
3. One of the guy wears a t-shirt that says “don’t fuck with Mr. Zero”!	3. Satu orang mengenakan kaos bertuliskan “jangan main-main dengan Mr. Zero!”

The first data is in the scene where Sally says “a lot of suicides.” To avoid any misunderstanding of the term “suicide,” the translator rendered it as “*pengorbanan*” because in this dialogue, Sally isn’t literally referring to suicide, but rather to sacrifice. The next data comes from the scene with Harry and Jess on the rugby field. In this scene, Harry says, “Well, that symptom is fucking my wife!”—a reference to the state of their marriage, which is heading toward divorce. In this sentence, the term “fuck” can also be translated as “mess” in a more polite form. So, the translator used the word “*merusak*” as the translation for “mess.” Harry, then, mentions the workers who came to his house, and one of them was wearing a T-shirt that read: “don’t fuck with Mr. Zero.” Again, the term “fuck” can be translated in many ways, but it almost always refers to something regrettable. So the translator once again translates “fuck” as “mess” into “*main-main*.”

7. Condensation

Condensation is a strategy used by translators when they omit or alter certain words due to subtitle line limitations or to avoid repetition. Of the six examples identified by the researcher in the film *When Harry Met Sally*, three represent the most complex instances of the condensation strategy.

SL: English	TL: Indonesian
1. Someone is staring at you in a personal growth	1. Seseorang melihatmu.
2. Plus, this is a perfect time to catch up on my window shopping.	2. Plus, ini adalah waktu yang sempurna untuk cuci mata
3. Right now is actually the right time to talk about this	3. Sekarang adalah waktu yang tepat

In the first data of condensation, Marie says, “*Ada seseorang yang memandangmu dengan intensitas atau kedekatan pribadi,*” but the translator omitted the phrase “*dengan intensitas atau kedekatan pribadi*”—which refers to intensity or closeness—and simply translated it as “*seseorang melihatmu*” because the meaning that someone was peering at Sally with an intimate gaze was already clear. In another data, in Harry’s monologue, he decides to go shopping aimlessly, and the term “window shopping” is translated as “*cuci mata,*” which

also means visiting several stores without a shopping plan. In this example, the translator omitted the phrase “*untuk mengejar*” to shorten the subtitle line.

In the third data, Harry urges Sally to talk about their relationship by saying, “*Sekarang sebenarnya adalah waktu yang tepat untuk membicarakan hal ini,*” but in this conversation, he doesn’t get straight to the point. Therefore, the translator shortened it to “*sekarang adalah waktu yang tepat.*” The time in question is the time to discuss the matter, which they had already mentioned in a previous conversation, so there’s no need to repeat it.

8. Resignation

Resignation is a strategy employed when a translator cannot find a solution for translating the source language and the intended meaning is inevitably lost; as a result, the translator chooses to retain the dialogue from the source language or omit the translated text from that scene.

SL: English	TL: Indonesian
1. He sings a love song as we go along. Walking in the winter wonderland	1. He sings a love song as we go along. Walking in the winter wonderland
2. Chicks and ducks and geese better scurry. When I take you out on my surrey.	2. Chicks and ducks and geese better scurry. When I take you out on my surrey.

In the data above, a Christmas song is playing. The translator could simply translate the lyrics, turning it into a transcription. However, the lyrics of “Winter Wonderland” have a specific meaning, so it’s best to keep them in the original language. Otherwise, it would confuse the audience and lose the metaphor. The second data is when Sally and Harry sing in a home goods store with a song about chicks, ducks, and swans.

In this scene, the song features nonsensical lyrics that simply play with words through their rhymes. If the lyrics “chicks and ducks and geese better scurry/when I take you out of my surrey” were translated into Indonesian, the original meaning would be lost and confusing, because the rhyme between ‘scurry’ and “surrey” in those lyrics is what’s important for poetic and comedic effect. Therefore, the lyrics are retained in the subtitles.

9. Transcription

Transcription is a technique used when a third language is spoken or when a character is speaking nonsense. There is only one example, as follow:

SL: English	TL: Indonesian
1. Buenos días, Señora Cleaver	1. Selamat pagi, Pak Cleaver

In this scene, Harry says to Sally, “*Semalam aku menonton ‘Leave It to Beaver’* in Spanish. *Buenos días, Señora Cleaver. ¿Dónde están Wallace y Theodore?*” He mimics the scene, but the lines following “*Buenos días, Señora Cleaver*” are not translated, so they fall into the category of withdrawal strategies. However, the Spanish phrase “*Buenos días*” is globally recognized as “*Selamat pagi*,” and the term “*señora*” is also often used to address a man, similar to “*Mister*” or “*Sir*,” so no English annotation is needed here.

10. Dislocation

Dislocation is used when the subtitler employs a specific special effect—such as a silly song in a cartoon—where the translation of that effect is more important than the story’s content. This study identified the data of the use of the dislocation strategy as follows:

SL: English	TL: Indonesian
1. Waiter, there is too much pepper on my paprikash	1. Pelayan, terlalu banyak pepper (lada) di- paprika -ku

This only data of dislocation in this film occurs when Harry and Sally are singing a children’s song. They mumble, “*Pelayan, ada terlalu banyak pepper (lada) di-paprika-ku*,” in a funny voice, but this sentence clearly has no meaning other than nonsense. However, the words “*pepper*” and “*paprikash*” need to be retained in the target language as a nod to the song. Therefore, the translator translates “*paprikash*” as “*paprika*” and “*pepper*” as “*lada*,” but adds a note to the word “*pepper*” because the word “*pepper*” needs to be retained.

CONCLUSION

This study concludes that the researcher identified all of Gottlieb’s subtitling strategies in the film *When Harry Met Sally* (1988). The most frequently identified strategy was paraphrase, while the least frequently identified strategies were dislocation and transcription. The paraphrase strategy emerged as the most dominant technique used by the translator, appearing 18 times out of the 50 data points collected in total (or 36%). This indicates a tendency among translators to prioritize conveying the message in a contextually appropriate manner so that it is easier for the target readers to understand. On the other hand, strategies such as condensation (12%), expansion (10%), deletion (10%), imitation (10%), and decimation (10%) are distributed fairly evenly but are not as significant as the use of paraphrasing. Meanwhile, the least frequently used strategies are transcription (2%) and dislocation (2%), indicating that translators rarely reposition text

elements or simply transcribe without adaptation. This led the researchers to conclude that in films that make heavy use of ambiguity, metaphors, and figurative language, paraphrasing is necessary to prevent the loss of meaning in translation. The dislocation strategy was difficult to identify because there are no singing scenes or background music in *When Harry Met Sally*. Furthermore, the absence of a third language made transcription the last strategy identified. The use of varied strategies in the translation of the film's subtitles from English to Indonesian reflects the translator's effort to balance meaning accuracy with linguistic appropriateness in the target text.

REFERENCES

- Alkafi, D. (2025). An Analysis of Cultural Words using Nababan's Accuracy and Gottlieb's Subtitling Strategies in Movie Subtitle *Penyalin Cahaya*. *JELL (Journal of English Language and Literature) STIBA-IEC Jakarta*, 10(02), 243-254.
- Chaume, F. (2012). *Audiovisual translation: Dubbing*. Manchester: St. Jerome Publishing.
- Creswell, J. W., & Poth, C. N. (2018). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches* (4th ed.). Sage Publications.
- Díaz Cintas, J. (2012). *Subtitling*. London: Routledge.
- Díaz Cintas, J., & Remael, A. (2007). *Audiovisual translation: Subtitling*. Manchester: St. Jerome Publishing.
- Ephron, N. (1989). *When Harry Met Sally* [Screenplay]. Daily Script. http://www.dailyscript.com/scripts/when_harry_met_sally.html
- Gottlieb, H. (1998). Subtitling. In M. Baker (Ed.), *Routledge encyclopedia of translation studies* (pp. 244–248). London: Routledge.
- Gottlieb, H. (1992). Subtitling: A new university discipline. *Teaching Translation and Interpreting*, 1, 161–170.
- Gottlieb, H. (1998). Subtitling. *Routledge Encyclopedia of Translation Studies*, 244–248.
- Hariyanto, S. (2005). Subtitling: Di antara Keterbatasan Bahasa-Budaya dan Media. In *Collection of International Conference on Translation: Translation, Discourse and Culture*
- Pramadanti, M., & Aryanika, S. (2025). Study of Subtitling Strategy in The School for Good and Evil: Kajian Strategi Penerjemahan dalam Subtitle Film *The School for Good and Evil*. *LITERATUR: Jurnal Bahasa dan Sastra*, 7(1), 143-160.
- Setiawan, J., Budiasningrum, R. S., & Efendi, A. S. (2024). An Analysis of Subtitling Strategies in *Inside Out* Movie Based on Gottlieb's Theory. *Jurnal Ilmiah Research Student*, 1(5), 119-125.
- Toury, G. (1995). *Descriptive translation studies and beyond*. John Benjamins Publishing Company.
- When Harry Met Sally* (N. Ephron, Writer; R. Reiner, Director). (1989). (anonym Translation). Retrieved from SubDL: <https://subdl.com/subtitle/sd20282/when-harry-met-sally/indonesian>
- Widyaningsih, P., Ediwan, I. N. T., & Rahayuni, N. K. S. (2022). English-Indonesian Subtitling Strategies Used in *Paterson* Movie. *Udayana Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities*, 6 (2).